

Immigrant, Racialised and Ethno-Culturally Diverse Communities and Community Treatment Orders: A Scoping Review

Hira Ahmad¹, Dr. Alasdair Forrest², Dr. Martin Rotenberg³,

¹*University of Aberdeen, UK*

²*NHS Grampian, Scotland*

³*The Centre for Addiction and Mental Health*

Correspondence: hira27a@yahoo.com

Poster presented at the BIMA National Conference on 28th June 2025

Purpose

People with serious mental illness from immigrant, racialised and ethno- culturally diverse communities experience greater coercion in mental health care. This review aims to scope the literature and synthesise findings relevant on the association between these groups, and the use of Community Treatment Orders (CTOs) and related forms of compulsory community treatment.

Methods

Five electronic databases were searched to identify relevant studies. Studies were included if they directly examined the association between immigrant, racialised and ethno-culturally diverse communities and community treatment orders and related forms of treatment or presented relevant data as part of a larger study.

Results

Of the 43 studies included nine studies focused directly on associations between immigrant, racialised and ethno-culturally diverse communities and CTOs, while 34 studies presented relevant data related to immigrant, racialised and ethno-culturally diverse communities and CTOs albeit not the primary focus of the study. Most studies were quantitative, with varied study designs. The

majority of studies were from Australia and New Zealand, followed by North America and the UK. Of the nine studies focusing directly on ethnicity and CTOs, results were mixed, and varied based on design, population and jurisdiction.

Conclusions

The relationship between ethnicity, immigration status, and CTOs is complex, with mixed findings across jurisdictions. Most of the literature comes from Australia and New Zealand, where Indigenous populations were a significant focus. The review highlights the need for more qualitative and quantitative research, especially in underrepresented ethnic groups and jurisdictions outside of Australia and New Zealand.

References

1. Mikellides G, Stefani A, Tantele M. Community treatment orders: international perspective. *BJPsych International*. 2019 Mar 29;16(04):83–6. doi: 10.1192/bji.2019.4.
2. Burns T, Molodynski A. Community Treatment Orders: Background and Implications of the OCTET Trial. *The Psychiatric Bulletin*. 2014 Feb;38(1):3–5. doi: 10.1192/pb.bp.113.044628.

3. Gajwani R, Parsons H, Birchwood M, Singh SP. Ethnicity and detention: Are Black and Minority Ethnic (BME) Groups Disproportionately Detained under the Mental Health Act 2007? *Social Psychiatry and Psychiatric Epidemiology*. 2016 May; 51(5):703–11. doi: 10.1007/s00127-016-1181-z.
4. Lei H, Barnicot K, Maynard E, Etherington A, Zalewska K, Quirk A, et al. Factors influencing use of community treatment orders and quality of care that people receive: results of a national survey in England and Wales. *BJPsych Bulletin*. 2019;43(5):227–35. doi:10.1192/bjb.2019.23.
5. Page MJ, McKenzie JE, Bossuyt PM, Boutron I, Hoffmann TC, Mulrow CD, et al. The PRISMA 2020 statement: an Updated Guideline for Reporting Systematic Reviews. *British Medical Journal*. 2021 Mar 29;372(71). doi:10.1136/bmj.n71.
6. Tricco AC, Lillie E, Zarin W, O'Brien KK, Colquhoun H, Levac D, et al. PRISMA Extension for Scoping Reviews (PRISMA-ScR): Checklist and Explanation. *Annals of Internal Medicine*. 2018 Oct 2;169(7):467–73. doi: 10.7326/M18-0850.
7. Haddaway NR, Grainger M, Gray C. citation-chaser: An R package and Shiny app for forward and backward citations chasing in academic searching. 2021 Feb 16; Available from: <https://estech.shinyapps.io/citationchaser/>. [Accessed: 2024 Sept 4].
8. Burgess P, Bindman J, Leese M, Henderson C, Szmukler G. Do Community Treatment Orders for Mental Illness Reduce Readmission to hospital? *Social Psychiatry and Psychiatric Epidemiology*. 2006 May 9; 41:574–9. doi: 10.1007/s00127-006-0063-1.
9. Moss K, Wyder M, Braddock V, Arroyo D, Kisely S. Compulsory Community Treatment and ethnicity: Findings from a Culturally and Linguistically Diverse Area of Queensland. *International Journal of Law and Psychiatry*. 2019 Jan-Feb;62:154–9. doi: 10.1016/j.ijlp.2018.09.007.
10. Kisely S, Yu D, Maehashi S, Siskind D. A Systematic Review and meta-analysis of Predictors and Outcomes of Community Treatment Orders in Australia and New Zealand. *Australian & New Zealand Journal of Psychiatry*. 2021 Jul;55(7):660-665. doi: 10.1177/0004867420954286.
11. Kisely S, Xiao J. Cultural and Linguistic Diversity Increases the Likelihood of Compulsory Community Treatment. *Schizophrenia Research*. 2018 Jul;197:104–8. doi: 10.1016/j.schres.2017.12.005.
12. Kisely S, Moss K, Boyd M, Siskind D. Efficacy of Compulsory Community Treatment and Use in Minority Ethnic Populations: A Statewide Cohort Study. *Australian & New Zealand Journal of Psychiatry*. 2020 Jan;54(1):76–88. doi: 10.1177/0004867419877690.
13. Brophy LM, Reece JE, McDermott F. A Cluster Analysis of people on Community Treatment Orders in Victoria, Australia. *International Journal of Law and Psychiatry*. 2006 Nov-Dec;29(6):469–81. doi: 10.1016/j.ijlp.2006.07.001.
14. Kisely S, Preston N, Xiao J, Lawrence D, Louise S, Crowe E, et al. An Eleven-year Evaluation of the Effect of Community Treatment Orders On changes in Mental Health Service Use. *Journal of Psychiatric Research*. 2013 May;47(5):650–6. doi: 10.1016/j.jpsychires.2013.01.010.
15. Kisely S, Xiao J, Crowe E, Paydar A, Jian L. The Effect of Community Treatment Orders on Outcome as Assessed by the Health of the Nation Outcome Scales. *Psychiatry Research*. 2014 Mar 30;215(3):574–8. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.psychres.2013.12.036>.
16. Kisely S, Xiao J, Lawrence D, Jian L. Is the Effect of Compulsory Community Treatment on Preventable Deaths from Physical Disorders Mediated by Better Access to Specialized Medical Procedures? *The Canadian Journal of Psychiatry*. 2014 Jan;59(1):54–8. doi: 10.1177/070674371405900110.
17. Kisely S, Xiao J, Jian L. Changes in Determinants of Compulsory Community Treatment over 11 years. A Population-based Analysis of Linked Mental Health Databases. *Psychiatry Research*. 2015 Dec 15;230(2):400–5. doi: 10.1016/j.psychres.2015.09.027.
18. Lambert TJ, Singh BS, Patel MX. Community Treatment Orders and Antipsychotic Long-Acting Injections. *British Journal of Psychiatry*. 2009;195(S52):s57–62. doi:10.1192/bjp.195.52.s57.
19. Morandi S, Golay P, Lambert M, Schimmelmann BG, McGorry PD, Cotton SM, et al. Community Treatment Order: Identifying the Need for More Evidence Based Justification of Its Use in First Episode

- Psychosis Patients. *Schizophrenia Research*. 2017 Jul;185:67–72. doi: 10.1016/j.schres.2016.12.022.
20. Suetani S, Kisely S, Parker S, Waterreus A, Morgan VA, Siskind D. Characteristics of People on Community Treatment Orders in Australia: Data from the 2010 National Survey of High Impact Psychosis. *Australian & New Zealand Journal of Psychiatry*. 2022 Jul;56(7):788–99. doi: 10.1177/00048674211036032.
21. Ogilvie JM, Kisely S. Examining the Health and Criminal Justice Characteristics for Young People on Compulsory Community Treatment orders: an Australian Birth Cohort and Data Linkage Study. *International Journal of Law and Psychiatry*. 2022 Jul-Aug;83:101813. doi: 10.1016/j.ijlp.2022.101813.
22. Parker S, Arnautovska U, McKeon G, Kisely S. The Association between Discontinuation of Community Treatment Orders and Outcomes in the 12-months following Discharge from Residential Mental Health Rehabilitation. *International Journal of Law and Psychiatry*. 2021 Jan-Feb;74:101664. doi: 10.1016/j.ijlp.2020.101664.
23. Segal SP, Hayes SL, Rimes L. The Utility of Outpatient Commitment: I. A Need for Treatment and a Least Restrictive Alternative to Psychiatric Hospitalization. *Psychiatric Services*. 2017 Dec 1;68(12):1247–54. doi: 10.1176/appi.ps.201600161.
24. Bardell-Williams M, Eaton S, Downey L, Bowtell M, Thien K, Ratheesh A, et al. Rates, Determinants and Outcomes Associated with the Use of Community Treatment Orders in Young People Experiencing First Episode Psychosis. *International Journal of Law and Psychiatry*. 2019 Jan-Feb;62:85–9. doi: 10.1016/j.ijlp.2018.11.007.
25. Kisely S, McMahon L, Siskind D. Benefits following Community Treatment Orders Have an Inverse Relationship with Rates of use: Meta-analysis and Meta-regression. *BJPsych Open*. 2023 Apr 14;9(3):e68. doi: 10.1192/bjo.2023.28.
26. Kisely S, Preston N, Xiao J, Lawrence D, Louise S, Crowe E. Reducing all-cause Mortality among Patients with Psychiatric disorders: a population-based Study. *Canadian Medical Association Journal*. 2013 Jan 8;185(1):E50–6. doi: 10.1503/cmaj.121077.
27. Segal SP, Burgess PM. Effect of Conditional Release from Hospitalization on Mortality Risk. *Psychiatric Services*. 2006 Nov;57(11):1607–13. doi: 10.1176/ps.2006.57.
28. Segal SP, Preston N, Kisely S, Xiao J. Conditional Release in Western Australia: Effect on Hospital Length of Stay. *Psychiatric Services*. 2009 Jan;60(1):94–9. doi: 10.1176/ps.2009.60.1.94.
29. Kisely SR, Xiao J, Preston NJ. Impact of Compulsory Community Treatment on Admission Rates. *British Journal of Psychiatry*. 2004;184(5):432–8. doi: 10.1192/bjp.184.5.432.
30. Newton-Howes G, Lacey CJ, Banks D. Community Treatment orders: the Experiences of Non-Maori and Maori within Mainstream and Maori Mental Health Services. *Social Psychiatry and Psychiatric Epidemiology*. 2014 Feb. 4;49(2):267–73. doi: 10.1007/s00127-013-0734-7.
31. Beaglehole B, Newton-Howes G, Frampton C. Compulsory Community Treatment Orders in New Zealand and the Provision of care: An Examination of National Databases and Predictors of Outcome. *The Lancet Regional Health - Western Pacific*. 2021 Sept 30;17:100275. doi: 10.1016/j.lanwpc.2021.100275.
32. Gibbs A, Dawson J, Forsyth H, Mullen R. TeOrangaTonuTanga (Maori Mental Health Team). Maori experience of community treatment orders in Otago, New Zealand. *Australian and New Zealand Journal of Psychiatry*. 2004 Oct;38(10):830–5. doi: 10.1080/j.1440-1614.2004.01468.x.
33. Beaglehole B, Newton-Howes G, Porter R, Frampton C. The Association between Compulsory Community Treatment Order Status and Mortality in New Zealand. *BJPsych Open*. 2023 Jan 13;9(1):e15. doi: 10.1192/bjo.2022.629.
34. Dey S, Mellsop G, Obertova Z, Jenkins M. Sociodemographic and Clinical Variables Associated with Discharge under Compulsory Treatment Orders. *Australasian Psychiatry*. 2021 Apr;29(2):163–8. doi: 10.1177/1039856220970054.
35. Swanson J, Swartz M, Van Dorn RA, Monahan J, McGuire TG, Steadman HJ, et al. Racial Disparities in Involuntary Outpatient Commitment: Are They Real? *Health Affairs*. 2009 May-Jun;28(3):816–26. doi: 10.1377/hlthaff.28.3.816.

36. Evans R, Makala J, Humphreys M, Mohan CRN. Supervised Community Treatment in Birmingham and Solihull: First 6 Months. *The Psychiatrist*. 2010;34(8):330–3. doi:10.1192/pb.bp.109.027482.
37. Galon PA, Wineman NM, Grande T. Influence of Race on Outpatient Commitment and Assertive Community Treatment for Persons with Severe and Persistent Mental Illness. *Archives of Psychiatric Nursing*. 2012 Jun;26(3):202–13. doi: 10.1016/j.apnu.2011.07.001.
38. Swartz M, Wagner H, Swanson J, Hiday V, Burns B. The Perceived Coerciveness of Involuntary Outpatient commitment: Findings from an Experimental Study. *Journal of the American Academy of Psychiatry and the Law*. 2002; 30(2):207–17. PMID: 12108557.
39. Gonzales L, Nesi D, Yanos PT. An Examination of Eligibility Decisions in New York State's Assisted Outpatient Treatment. *Psychiatric Services*. 2015 Dec 1;66(12):1373–6. doi: 10.1176/appi.ps.201400437.
40. Swartz MS, Swanson JW, Hiday VA, Wagner HR, Burns BJ, Borum R. A Randomized Controlled Trial of Outpatient Commitment in North Carolina. *Psychiatric Services*. 2001 Mar;52(3):325–9. doi: 10.1176/appi.ps.52.3.325.
41. Van Dorn RA, Elbogen EB, Redlich AD, Swanson JW, Swartz MS, Mustillo S. The Relationship between Mandated Community Treatment and Perceived Barriers to Care in Persons with Severe Mental Illness. *International Journal of Law and Psychiatry*. 2006 Nov-Dec;29(6):495–506. doi: 10.1016/j.ijlp.2006.08.002.
42. Mfofo-M'Carthy M. Community Treatment Orders and the Experiences of Ethnic Minority Individuals Diagnosed with Serious Mental Illness in the Canadian Mental Health System. *International Journal for Equity in Health*. 2014 Sep 6;13 (1). doi: 10.1186/s12939-014-0069-3.
43. O'Brien AM, Farrell SJ, Faulkner S. Community Treatment Orders: Beyond Hospital Utilization Rates Examining the Association of Community Treatment Orders with Community Engagement and Supportive Housing. *Community Mental Health Journal*. 2009 Dec;45(6):415–9. doi: 10.1007/s10597-009-9203-x.
44. Kisely S. Canadian Studies on the Effectiveness of Community Treatment Orders. *The Canadian Journal of Psychiatry*. 2016 Jan;61(1):7–14. doi: 10.1177/0706743715620414.
45. Patel MX, Matonhodze J, Baig MK, Gilleen J, Boydell J, Holloway F, et al. Increased Use of Antipsychotic long-acting Injections with Community Treatment Orders. *Therapeutic Advances in Psychopharmacology*. 2011 Apr;1(2):37–45. doi: 10.1177/2045125311407960.
46. Weich S, Duncan C, Twigg L, McBride O, Parsons H, Moon G, et al. Use of Community Treatment Orders and Their outcomes: an Observational Study. *Health Services and Delivery Research*. 2020 Mar 2;8(9):1-104. doi: 10.3310/hsdr08090.
47. Monnery D, Belgamwar RB. Use of Supervised Community Treatment in one UK Healthcare District. *Progress in Neurology and Psychiatry*. 2011 Nov 1;15(6). doi: 10.1002/pnp.217
48. Paduret G, Kelbrick M. Community Treatment Orders in an Early Intervention for Psychosis Service. *Progress in Neurology and Psychiatry*. 2023 Aug 9;27(3):17–9. <https://doi.org/10.1002/pnp.798>.
49. Barkhuizen W, Cullen AE, Shetty H, Pritchard M, Stewart R, McGuire P, et al. Community Treatment Orders and Associations with Readmission Rates and Duration of Psychiatric Hospital Admission: A Controlled Electronic Case Register Study. *BMJ Open*. 2020 Mar 5;10(3):e035121. doi: 10.1136/bmjopen-2019-035121.
50. Silva B, Golay P, Boubaker K, Bonsack C, Morandi S. Community Treatment Orders in Western Switzerland: A Retrospective Epidemiological Study. *International Journal of Law and Psychiatry*. 2019 Nov-Dec;67:101509. doi: 10.1016/j.ijlp.2019.101509.
51. Kisely S, Moss K, Boyd M, Siskind D. Efficacy of Compulsory Community Treatment and Use in Minority Ethnic populations: a Statewide Cohort Study. *Australian & New Zealand Journal of Psychiatry*. 2019 Sep 26;54(1):76–88. doi:10.1177/0004867419877690.